

## **Appendix B**

*Supporting Tables for Concurrence Section of Consultation and Species  
Removed from Further Consideration*

**APPENDIX B: SUPPORTING TABLES FOR CONCURRENCE SECTION OF CONSULTATION  
AND SPECIES REMOVED FROM FURTHER CONSIDERATION**

**Table 1.** Species for which the EPA made a “no effect” determination. Critical habitat is not applicable for these species.

Entity ID	Status	Taxa Group	Scientific Name	Common Name	EPA Species Determination*	EPA Critical Habitat Determination*
68	Endangered	Birds	<i>Corvus hawaiiensis</i>	Hawaiian (=‘alala) Crow <sup>1</sup>	NE - EXTINCT	NA
141	Endangered	Birds	<i>Corvus leucognaphalus</i>	White-necked crow <sup>2</sup>	NE - EXTINCT	NA
10582	Endangered	Birds	<i>Gymnomyza samoensis</i>	Ma'oma'o <sup>2</sup>	NE - EXTINCT	NA
6345	Endangered	Birds	<i>Rhynchopsitta pachyrhyncha</i>	Thick-billed parrot <sup>2</sup>	NE - EXTINCT	NA
122	Endangered	Birds	<i>Zosterops conspicillatus conspicillatus</i>	Bridled white-eye	NE - EXTINCT	NA
26	Endangered	Mammals	<i>Pteropus tokudae</i>	Little Mariana fruit bat	NE - EXTINCT	NA
19	Delisted (formerly Endangered)	Mammals	<i>Puma concolor cougar</i>	Eastern puma	NE – EXTINCT	NA
397	Endangered	Snails	<i>Achatinella caesia</i> , <i>A. casta</i> , <i>A. decora</i> , <i>A. lehuiensis</i> , <i>A. papyracea</i> , <i>A. spaldingi</i> , <i>A. thaahumi</i> , <i>A. buddi</i> , <i>A. vittata</i>	Oahu tree snails <sup>3</sup>	NE - EXTINCT	NA

\*NE = No Effect; NA = Not Applicable

<sup>1</sup> The FWS included this species in the Opinion. Captive bred individuals have been reintroduced, and thus the species is currently extant in the wild.

<sup>2</sup> Currently extirpated in the U.S. and its territories. Recolonization or reintroduction efforts could return this species to the U.S. and/or its territories in the future.

<sup>3</sup> Species in the genus *Achatinella* are addressed in the Opinion as one listed entity.

**Table 2.** FWS concurrence on species and critical habitats with EPA “may affect, not likely to adversely affect” determinations.

Entity ID	Status	Taxa Group	Species Scientific Name	Common Name	EPA Species Determination*	FWS Concurs with EPA’s Determination of NLAA?*	EPA Critical Habitat Determination*	FWS Concurs with EPA’s Determination of NLAA?*
75	Endangered	Birds	<i>Acrocephalus familiaris kingi</i>	Nihoa millerbird (old world warbler)	NLAA - outside use area	Y	NA	NA
64	Endangered	Birds	<i>Akialoa stejnegeri</i>	Kauai akialoa (honeycreeper)	NLAA - possibly extinct	Y	NA	NA
70	Endangered	Birds	<i>Anas laysanensis</i>	Laysan duck	NLAA – outside use area	Y	NA	NA
100	Endangered	Birds	<i>Hemignathus hanapepe</i>	Kauai nukupuu (honeycreeper)	NLAA - possibly extinct	Y	NA	NA
77	Endangered	Birds	<i>Moho braccatus</i>	Kauai `o`o (honeyeater)	NLAA - possibly extinct	Y	NA	NA
105	Endangered	Birds	<i>Myadestes myadestinus</i>	Large Kauai (=kamao) Thrush	NLAA - possibly extinct	Y	NA	NA
91	Endangered	Birds	<i>Numenius borealis</i>	Eskimo curlew	NLAA - possibly extinct	Y <sup>1</sup>	NA	NA
109	Endangered	Birds	<i>Paroreomyza flammea</i>	Molokai creeper	NLAA - possibly extinct	Y	NA	NA
71	Endangered	Birds	<i>Telespyza cantans</i>	Laysan finch (honeycreeper)	NLAA – outside use area	Y	NA	NA
72	Endangered	Birds	<i>Telespyza ultima</i>	Nihoa finch (honeycreeper)	NLAA – outside use area	Y	NA	NA
93	Endangered	Birds	<i>Vermivora bachmanii</i>	Bachman's warbler (=wood)	NLAA - possibly extinct	Y <sup>2</sup>	NA	NA
5232	Threatened	Mammals	<i>Enhydra lutris kenyoni</i>	Northern sea otter	NLAA – qual. analysis <sup>3</sup>	Y	NLAA – qual. analysis <sup>3</sup>	Y
23	Endangered	Mammals	<i>Herpailurus (=Felis) yagouaroundi tolteca</i>	Sinaloan Jaguarundi	NLAA – possibly extinct	Y <sup>1</sup>	NA	NA
1302	EXPN	Mammals	<i>Ursus arctos horribilis</i>	Grizzly bear	NLAA – possibly extinct	EXPN <sup>4</sup>	NA	NA
8861	Threatened	Mammals	<i>Ursus maritimus</i>	Polar bear	NLAA – qual. analysis <sup>3</sup>	Y	NA	NDAM <sup>5</sup>

Entity ID	Status	Taxa Group	Species Scientific Name	Common Name	EPA Species Determination*	FWS Concurrs with EPA's Determination of NLAA?*	EPA Critical Habitat Determination*	FWS Concurrs with EPA's Determination of NLAA?*
499	Endangered	Plants	<i>Amaranthus brownii</i>	No common name	NLAA – outside use area	Y	NLAA – outside use area	Y
598	Endangered	Plants	<i>Pritchardia remota</i>	Lo`ulu	LAA	NJ	NLAA – outside use area	Y
606	Endangered	Plants	<i>Schiedea verticillata</i>	No common name	NLAA – outside use area	Y	NLAA – outside use area	Y

\* NA = Not Applicable; NA (NL) = Not Applicable (Not Listed); NDAM = No destruction or adverse modification; NE = No effect; NJ = No jeopardy; NLAA = May affect, not likely to adversely affect; Y = Yes.

<sup>1</sup> The FWS determined the Action is not likely to adversely affect the species because we do not anticipate overlap of use sites with the species' range; we have not concluded that the species is presumed extinct.

<sup>2</sup> The FWS determined the Action is not likely to adversely affect the species because it is unlikely to be exposed to malathion in habitats where it most likely occurs if still extant (i.e., dense palustrine forested wetlands); we have not concluded that the species is presumed extinct.

<sup>3</sup> Determination is based on a qualitative analysis on seals and other marine mammals. See Chapter 4: Section 7.3 in EPA's BE for malathion for more information.

<sup>4</sup> A nonessential experimental grizzly bear population was designated in the Bitterroot Grizzly Bear Experimental Population area (50 CFR § 17.84(1)) in 2000 and was assigned Entity ID 1302 by the FWS. Separate conclusions are not provided in the malathion Opinion for individual experimental populations, as they are generally covered as part of our analyses of the listed species. Federal agencies are not required to consult on nonessential experimental populations unless their proposed action is likely to jeopardize the species. As described in the Opinion, we do not anticipate such an outcome for this species. Further, in this case, the FWS has not released or reintroduced any grizzly bears into the experimental population area, and any grizzly bears that have dispersed into the area on their own are protected as threatened under the ESA (USFWS 2021). The grizzly bear was given a "may affect, likely to adversely affect" determination by EPA in the malathion BE. While we do not address the experimental population separately in the concurrence section, we do address the grizzly bear listed entities together in Appendix K of the Opinion. Reference: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2021. Biological report for the grizzly bear (*Ursus arctos horribilis*) in the Lower-48 States. Version 1.1, January 31, 2021. Missoula, Montana. 370 pp.

<sup>5</sup> Critical habitat has been designated for this species. FWS included it in the Opinion and made a NDAM determination (see Appendix L). EPA did not make a determination for the species' critical habitat.

**Table 3.** Species removed from further consideration in this consultation due to recent delistings of threatened or endangered species (i.e., “Delisted”), “not warranted” or “warranted, but precluded” findings for proposed or candidate species (i.e., “Not listed”), or due to other changes (e.g., revised taxon).

Entity ID	Taxa Group	Species Scientific Name	Common Name	EPA Species Determination*	EPA Critical Habitat Determination*	Reason Not Considered
8765	Amphibians	<i>Gyrinophilus gulolineatus</i>	Berry Cave salamander	LAA	NA	Not listed
9694	Amphibians	<i>Hyla wrightorum</i>	Arizona treefrog (Huachuca/Canelo Population)	LAA	NA	Not listed
3628	Amphibians	<i>Lithobates onca</i>	Relict leopard frog	LAA	NA	Not listed
7482	Amphibians	<i>Notophthalmus perstriatus</i>	Striped newt	LAA	NA	Not listed
5819	Amphibians	<i>Rana luteiventris</i>	Columbia spotted frog (Great Basin DPS)	LAA	NA	Not listed
10021	Birds	<i>Amazona viridigenalis</i>	Red-crowned parrot	LAA	NA	Not listed
9966	Birds	<i>Anthus spragueii</i>	Sprague's Pipit	LAA	NA	Not listed
8386	Birds	<i>Buteo solitarius</i>	Hawaiian (=‘lo) Hawk	LAA	NA	Delisted
4120	Birds	<i>Centrocercus urophasianus</i>	Greater sage-grouse (Columbia basin DPS, WA)	LAA	NA	Not listed
8741	Birds	<i>Centrocercus urophasianus</i>	Greater sage-grouse (Entire)	LAA	NA	Not listed
1353	Birds	<i>Porzana tabuensis</i>	Spotless Crake	LAA	NA	Not listed
94	Birds	<i>Setophaga kirtlandii</i> (= <i>Dendroica kirtlandii</i> )	Kirtland's warbler	LAA	NA	Delisted
134	Birds	<i>Sterna antillarum</i>	Least tern (Interior population)	LAA	NA	Delisted
6618	Birds	<i>Synthliboramphus hypoleucus</i>	Xantus's murrelet	LAA	NA	Not listed
2691	Birds	<i>Tympanuchus pallidicinctus</i>	Lesser prairie-chicken	LAA	NA	Not listed
138	Birds	<i>Vireo atricapilla</i>	Black-capped Vireo	LAA	NA	Delisted
10039	Clams	<i>Quadrula aurea</i>	Golden orb	LAA	NA	Not listed

Entity ID	Taxa Group	Species Scientific Name	Common Name	EPA Species Determination*	EPA Critical Habitat Determination*	Reason Not Considered
9969	Clams	<i>Quadrula houstonensis</i>	Smooth pimpleback	LAA	NA	Not listed
2381	Crustaceans	<i>Metabetaeus lohena</i>	Anchialine pool shrimp	LAA	NA	Not listed
5089	Crustaceans	<i>Palaemonella burnsi</i>	Anchialine pool shrimp	LAA	NA	Not listed
5714	Crustaceans	<i>Stygobromus kenki</i>	Kenk's amphipod	LAA	NA	Not listed
289	Fishes	<i>Catostomus microps</i>	Modoc sucker	LAA	NA	Delisted
3879	Fishes	<i>Etheostoma cragini</i>	Arkansas darter	LAA	NA	Not listed
10221	Fishes	<i>Etheostoma sagitta</i>	Cumberland arrow darter	LAA	NA	Not listed
253	Fishes	<i>Gila boraxobius</i>	Borax Lake chub	LAA	LAA	Delisted
8561	Fishes	<i>Gila nigra</i>	Headwater chub	LAA	NA	Not listed
8442	Fishes	<i>Moxostoma sp.</i>	Sicklefin redbhorse	LAA	NA	Not listed
4460	Fishes	<i>Oncorhynchus clarkii virginalis</i>	Rio Grande cutthroat trout	LAA	NA	Not listed
304	Fishes	<i>Oregonichthys crameri</i>	Oregon chub	LAA	NA	Delisted
267	Fishes	<i>Rhinichthys osculus ssp.</i>	Foskett speckled dace	LAA	NA	Delisted
880	Flowering Plants	<i>Arenaria cumberlandensis</i>	Cumberland sandwort	LAA	NA	Delisted
5212	Flowering Plants	<i>Artemisia campestris var. wormskioldii</i>	Northern wormwood	LAA	NA	Not listed
509	Flowering Plants	<i>Astragalus desereticus</i>	Deseret milkvetch	LAA	NA	Delisted
2567	Flowering Plants	<i>Astragalus microcymbus</i>	Skiff milkvetch	LAA	NA	Not listed
2780	Flowering Plants	<i>Boechera pusilla</i>	Fremont County rockcress	LAA	NA	Not listed
1632	Flowering Plants	<i>Chorizanthe parryi var. fernandina</i>	San Fernando Valley spineflower	LAA	NA	Not listed

Entity ID	Taxa Group	Species Scientific Name	Common Name	EPA Species Determination*	EPA Critical Habitat Determination*	Reason Not Considered
7264	Flowering Plants	<i>Dichanthelium (=Panicum) hirstii</i>	Hirst Brother's panic grass	LAA	NA	Not listed
5468	Flowering Plants	<i>Eriogonum soredium</i>	Frisco buckwheat	LAA	NA	Not listed
554	Flowering Plants	<i>Gaura neomexicana</i> var. <i>coloradensis</i>	Colorado Butterfly plant	LAA	LAA	Delisted
1047	Flowering Plants	<i>Howellia aquatilis</i>	Water howellia	LAA	NA	Delisted
7992	Flowering Plants	<i>Lepidium ostleri</i>	Ostler's peppergrass	LAA	NA	Not listed
1225	Flowering Plants	<i>Lomantium bradshawii</i>	Bradshaw's [desert-parsley] lomatium	LAA	NA	Delisted
783	Flowering Plants	<i>Oenothera avita</i> ssp. <i>eurekaensis</i>	Eureka Valley evening-primrose	LAA	NA	Delisted
834	Flowering Plants	<i>Solidago albopilosa</i>	White-haired goldenrod	LAA	NA	Delisted
854	Flowering Plants	<i>Trichostema austromontanum</i> ssp. <i>compactum</i>	Hidden Lake bluecurls	LAA	NA	Delisted
10028	Flowering Plants	<i>Trifolium friscanum</i>	Frisco clover	LAA	NA	Not listed
1041	Flowering Plants	<i>Trifolium stoloniferum</i>	Running buffalo clover	LAA	NA	Delisted
5386	Insects	<i>Ambrysus funebris</i>	Nevars Spring naucorid bug (=Furnace Creek)	LAA	NA	Not listed
10130	Insects	<i>Arsapnia arapahoe</i>	Arapahoe snowfly	LAA	NA	Not listed
1450	Insects	<i>Cicindela highlandensis</i>	Highlands tiger beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
3748	Insects	<i>Glyphopsyche sequatchie</i>	Sequatchie caddisfly	LAA	NA	Not listed
2767	Insects	<i>Heterelmis stephani</i>	Stephan's riffle beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
5064	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus caecus</i>	Clifton cave beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
6464	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus colemanensis</i>	Coleman cave beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
1538	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus fowlerae</i>	Fowler's cave beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed

Entity ID	Taxa Group	Species Scientific Name	Common Name	EPA Species Determination*	EPA Critical Habitat Determination*	Reason Not Considered
2862	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus frigidus</i>	Icebox cave beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
5318	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus frigidus</i>	Indian Grave Point cave beetle (=Soothsayer)	LAA	NA	Not listed
7659	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus inquisitor</i>	Inquirer cave beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
2065	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus insularis</i>	Baker Station cave beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
7134	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus parvus</i>	Tatum cave beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
7745	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus paulus</i>	Nobletts cave beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
3379	Insects	<i>Pseudanophthalmus troglodytes</i>	Louisville cave beetle	LAA	NA	Not listed
10178	Mammals	<i>Arborimus longicaudus</i>	Red tree vole	LAA	NA	Not listed
4016	Mammals	<i>Gulo gulo luscus</i>	North American wolverine	LAA	NA	Not listed
47	Mammals	<i>Leptonycteris curasoae yerbabuenae</i>	Lesser long-nosed bat	LAA	NA	Delisted
61	Mammals	<i>Microtus mexicanus hualpaiensis</i>	Hualapai Mexican vole	LAA	NA	Not listed
9709	Mammals	<i>Odobenus rosmarus ssp. divergens</i>	Pacific Walrus	NLAA – outside use area	NA	Not listed
10/6334	Mammals	<i>Sciurus niger cinereus</i>	Delmarva Peninsula fox squirrel	LAA	NA	Not listed
3778	Mammals	<i>Sylvilagus transitionalis</i>	New England Cottontail Rabbit	LAA	NA	Not listed
2299	Mammals	<i>Urocyon endemicus</i>	Southern Idaho ground Squirrel	LAA	NA	Not listed
2389	Mammals	<i>Urocyon washingtoni</i>	Washington ground squirrel	LAA	NA	Not listed
1236	Mammals	<i>Urocyon littoralis littoralis</i>	San Miguel Island Fox	LAA	NA	Delisted
1238	Mammals	<i>Urocyon littoralis santacruzae</i>	Santa Cruz Island Fox	LAA	NA	Delisted
1239	Mammals	<i>Urocyon littoralis santarosae</i>	Santa Rosa Island Fox	LAA	NA	Delisted

Entity ID	Taxa Group	Species Scientific Name	Common Name	EPA Species Determination*	EPA Critical Habitat Determination*	Reason Not Considered
36	Mammals	<i>Ursus americanus luteolus</i>	Louisiana black bear	LAA	NA	Delisted
9304	Reptiles	<i>Chionactis occipitalis klauberi</i>	Tucson Shovel-Nosed Snake	LAA	NA	Not listed
7964	Reptiles	<i>Gopherus agassizii</i>	Desert tortoise	LAA	NA	Not listed
10291	Reptiles	<i>Gopherus morafkai</i>	Sonoran Desert Tortoise	LAA	NA	Not listed
160	Reptiles	<i>Lepidochelys olivacea</i>	Olive ridley sea turtle	LAA	NA	Revised Taxon <sup>1</sup>
177	Reptiles	<i>Sphaerodactylus micropithecus</i>	Monito gecko	LAA	NA	Delisted
8434	Snails	<i>Elimia melanoidea</i>	Black mudalia	LAA	NA	Not listed
5666	Snails	<i>Pyrgulopsis morrisoni</i>	Page springsnail	LAA	NA	Not listed
6739	Snails	<i>Pyrgulopsis thompsoni</i>	Huachuca springsnail	LAA	NA	Not listed

\* NA = Not Applicable; NLAA = May affect, not likely to adversely affect; LAA = May affect, likely to adversely affect

<sup>1</sup> This entity ID is now represented by other listed olive ridley sea turtle populations.